Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine
Sanctuary Advisory Council

NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Thorne Abbott
Business Commerce

Glenn Hong
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana
Conservation

Judith Lemus
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney
Fishing

Steve Turner
Hawai'i Island

Maxx Phillips
O'ahu Island

Nina Monasevitch
Kaua'i Island

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Lāna'i Island

Robin Newbold
Maui Island

Vacant
Moloka'i Island

Sabra Kauka
Native Hawaiian

Jim Coon
Ocean Recreation

Mark Deakos
Research

Vacant
Tourism

Tara Leota
Whale Watching

GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Bruce Anderson
Division of Aquatic Resources

Alec Wong
DOH

Sandra Rossetter
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey
OHA (Voting)

Allen Tom
Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma
WESPAC (Voting)

Tunis McElwain
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa
US Navy

MEETING MINUTES

JOINT SANCTUARY AND RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING
Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve Advisory Council
Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

75th Meeting
Meeting Wednesday, December 6, 2017
9:00am-4:00pm
Pagoda Hotel and Restaurant, International Ballroom
1525 Rycroft Street, Honolulu, Hawai‘i 96814

Note: The content of this document was provided to the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve Advisory Council. The content may appear differently in the final meeting minutes pending vote by the council.

Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES:
Sanctuary Advisory Council (SAC) Voting Members Present: Maka‘ala Ka‘aumoana (Conservation, Vice Chair); Judy Lemus (Education, Secretary); Jim Coon (Ocean Recreation); Tara Leota (Whale Watching); Steve Turner (Hawai‘i Island); Maxx Phillips (Oahu Island); Nina Monasevitch (Kaua‘i Island); Solomon Kaho‘ohalahala (Lāna‘i Island, Chair); Robin Newbold (Maui Island); Thorne Abbott (Business/Commerce Alternate for Vacant); Sabra Kauka (Native Hawaiian); Keola Lindsey (Office of Hawaiian Affairs [OHA]); Josh DeMello (Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council [WPFMC]).

SAC Voting Members Absent: Glenn Hong (Commercial Shipping); Rick Gaffney (Fishing); Mark Deakos (Research).

SAC Non- Voting Members Present: Jens Currie (Research Alternate); Carlie Wiener (Education Alternate for Lemus); Anabelle Padilla (Youth Seat Alternate for Honeker); Hoku Cody (Native Hawaiian Alternate for Kauka); Athline Clark (Office of National Marine Sanctuaries [ONMS] / Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument [PMNM]); Janice Fukawa (Depart of Defense, US Navy); Ted Kerns (NOAA Office of Law Enforcement); Jessica Kondel (ONMS/Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary); Melanie Lander (State of Hawai‘i Office of Planning); Tunis McElwain (US Army Corps of Engineers); Jeff Walters (NOAA Fisheries Pacific Islands Regional Office); Alec Wong (State of Hawai‘i Department of Health).

SAC Non-Voting Members Absent: Eric Roberts (U.S. Coast Guard [USCG]); Bruce Anderson (State of Hawai‘i Division of Aquatic Resources); Veronica Rocha (Dept. of Business, Economic Development & Tourism/Renewable Energy).

"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."

NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Thorne Abbott
Business Commerce

Glenn Hong
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana
Conservation

Judith Lemus
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney
Fishing

Steve Turner
Hawai'i Island

Maxx Phillips
O'ahu Island

Nina Monasevitch
Kaua'i Island

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Lāna'i Island

Robin Newbold
Maui Island

Vacant
Moloka'i Island

Sabra Kauka
Native Hawaiian

Jim Coon
Ocean Recreation

Mark Deakos
Research

Vacant
Tourism

Tara Leota
Whale Watching

GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Bruce Anderson
Division of Aquatic Resources

Alec Wong
DOH

Sandra Rossetter
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey
OHA (Voting)

Allen Tom
Hawaiian Islands
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma
WESPAC (Voting)

Tunis McElwain
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa
US Navy

ONMS Staff: Pua Borges-Smith, Kalani Quiocho, Naomi McIntosh, Nicole Evans, Alyssa Miller, Alan Lum, Toni Parras, Justin Rivera (PMNM); Patty Miller (HIHWNMS); Allen Tom (Pacific Islands Region); John Armor by phone.

Other Agency Staff: Maria Carnevale (State of Hawai‘i, Department of Land and Natural Resources [DLNR] Division of Aquatic Resources [DAR]); Brandon JimOn (NOAA Office of Law Enforcement); Brad Ka‘aleleo Wong (OHA).

Reserve Advisory Council (RAC) Members Present: Linda Paul, William Aila Jr., Nakoa Goo, Tammy Harp, Carol Wilcox, Jean Kenyon, Pelika Andrade, Geoff Walker, Cindy Hunter, Judith Cucco, Kem Lowry, Hoku Ka‘aekuahiwi-Pousima, Matt Brown.

Members of the Public: Carlos Santana (Office of Senator Mazie Hirono); Alison Rieser (University of Hawai‘i); David Delaney (Delaney Aquatic Consulting); Barb Mayer; Monty Clark.

I. OPENING PROTOCOL (PMNM STAFF) PMNM staff members opens the meeting with meles *Puka Mai ka Lā* and *Mele No Papahānaumokuākea*.

II. ROLL CALL; REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (AILA JR. AND KAHO‘OHALAHALA) Co-chairs William Aila Jr. and Solomon Kaho‘ohalahala called the meeting to order. There were no changes to the published agenda. A quorum of members from both advisory councils were present, and the meeting, having been duly convened, was ready to proceed with business.

III. REVIEW OF AGENDA AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES (AILA JR. AND KAHO‘OHALAHALA) The respective Council approved the meeting minutes from the October 12, 2017 RAC meeting. The respective Council approved the meeting minutes from the August 16, 2017 SAC meeting.

IV. JOHN ARMOR TALK STORY (ARMOR) NOAA Office of National Marine Sanctuaries Director John Armor joined the Joint Council Meeting via Google Hangouts. Mr. Armor discussed the new ONMS Strategic Plan, Executive Orders 13792 and 13795, and the ONMS Budget for 2018. The ONMS Strategic Plan and information on the Executive Orders are available on the RAC website.

Mr. Armor also discussed personnel changes within the ONMS offices. Dr. Rebecca Holyoke is the new Deputy Director of ONMS. Sarah Fangman has been named the new Superintendent of the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary. Jessica Kondel is completing her reassignment duties as Acting Superintendent HIHWNMS. She will be returning to Washington DC at the end of December. The Department of Commerce (DOC) has two new political appointees under the new administration. The appointees are Secretary of Commerce Wilbur Ross and Assistant Secretary of Commerce (Oceans and Atmosphere) RDML Timothy Galluadet. The DOC and ONMS Organization Charts are available on the RAC website.

"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."

NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Thorne Abbott
Business Commerce

Glenn Hong
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana
Conservation

Judith Lemus
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney
Fishing

Steve Turner
Hawai'i Island

Maxx Phillips
O'ahu Island

Nina Monasevitch
Kaua'i Island

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Lāna'i Island

Robin Newbold
Maui Island

Vacant
Moloka'i Island

Sabra Kauka
Native Hawaiian

Jim Coon
Ocean Recreation

Mark Deakos
Research

Vacant
Tourism

Tara Leota
Whale Watching

GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Bruce Anderson
Division of Aquatic Resources

Alec Wong
DOH

Sandra Rossetter
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey
OHA (Voting)

Allen Tom
Hawaiian Islands
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma
WESPAC (Voting)

Tunis McElwain
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa
US Navy

A teleconference follow-up on the ONMS Recreational Fishing Summit will be held on December 8, 2017.

Mr. Armor also took questions from the two Councils. Councilmembers asked Mr. Armor about his background, for more information on the political appointees, and how the Councils can further protect their respective Sanctuary or Reserve.

V. SAC PRESENTATION (KAHOʻOHALAHALA) Sanctuary Advisory Council Chair Solomon Kahoʻohalahala presented the Councils with a short video about the importance of koholā (Humpback whale) in Native Hawaiian culture. The video is still in draft form but will be shared with the public at a later date.

VI. RAC PRESENTATION (AILA JR) Reserve Advisory Council Chair William Aila Jr. gave a brief presentation to the Councils about the history of the RAC, recent RAC accomplishments, and the Council's current goals. The presentation is available on the RAC website.

VII. NATIVE HAWAIIAN PLAN (QUIOCHO/WONG) ONMS-PMNM Native Hawaiian Specialist Kalani Quiocho and OHA Papahānaumokuākea Program Specialist Brad Kaʻaleleo Wong presented the current iteration of the PMNM Native Hawaiian Plan. The presentation highlighted the plan development goals, outline and timeline of the plan. A draft outline and the presentation are available on the RAC website.

VIII. CAPACITY BUILDING ACROSS RAC/SAC (KAHOʻOHALAHALA/AILA JR./ CLARK) Chairmen Kahoʻohalahala and Aila Jr. presented the need for a joint working group of both Councils to examine capacity building across Councils.

RAC Action Item: The Council makes a motion that the RAC establish a Joint Working Group with the SAC. The motion is seconded. The Council votes unanimously to establish the Joint Working Group.

SAC Action Item: The Council makes a motion that the SAC establish a Joint Working Group with the RAC. The motion is seconded. The Council votes unanimously to establish the Joint Working Group.

The Councils are urged to consider what topics they would like to cover in capacity building and what members would like to participate.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENT: David Delaney (Delany Aquatic Consulting) just completed a post-doc and published a paper he wanted to share with the Councils. *Patterns in Artisanal Coral Reef Fisheries Revealed Through Local Monitoring Efforts* is available on the RAC website.

X. 30X30 CORAL REEF UPDATE (CHUNG/ STATE OF HAWAIʻI) Anne Chung presented on the State of Hawaii's 30x30 for marine conservation goal. At the Hawaiʻi-hosted 2016 IUCN World Conservation Congress, Governor Ige announced the Sustainable Hawaiʻi Initiative. The Initiative aims to increase the sustainability in Hawaii by setting concrete, measurable

NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Thorne Abbott
Business Commerce

Glenn Hong
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana
Conservation

Judith Lemus
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney
Fishing

Steve Turner
Hawai'i Island

Maxx Phillips
O'ahu Island

Nina Monasevitch
Kaua'i Island

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Lāna'i Island

Robin Newbold
Maui Island

Vacant
Moloka'i Island

Sabra Kauka
Native Hawaiian

Jim Coon
Ocean Recreation

Mark Deakos
Research

Vacant
Tourism

Tara Leota
Whale Watching

GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Bruce Anderson
Division of Aquatic Resources

Alec Wong
DOH

Sandra Rossetter
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey
OHA (Voting)

Allen Tom
Hawaiian Islands
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma
WESPAC (Voting)

Tunis McElwain
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa
US Navy

targets for both private and public sectors. The Initiative included a target for the marine management community and led by DAR - to effectively manage 30% of Hawaii's nearshore marine areas by 2030. The 30x30 Vision is: A healthy nearshore ecosystem and abundant fish, which allows the people of Hawaii and our visitors to enjoy nearshore waters, support local livelihoods, and feed their families. The complete presentation is available on the RAC website.

XI. Break-out Session

Councilmembers broke into two working groups to jointly develop a set of bulletlists for response to decision on Presidential Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 and topics to include in comment letter for The Draft Hawaii-Southern California Test and Training Environmental Impact Statement/Overseas EIS.

Group A: Bulletlist of topics to include in response to decision on Presidential Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 – Report Out

- Make case that public participation did occur before the decisions were made for all Monuments
- Do not mention Rose/PRI/Obama by-name, not the RAC/SAC kuleana and a focus on all Monuments generally
- Concept of Marine Monuments in general is a good concept
- Separate letter for PMNM
- Hawaiian concept of land and horizon of our āina. Complete ecosystem.
- Larger size better for management reasons
- New seamounts and other deep resources – contain new species to science- "objects of scientific interest"
- New scientific evidence of length of some of these deep-sea resources in the ecosystem they inhabit
- Not enough is known about those species – could jeopardize their very existence of many of these species (example of Casper)
- Islands within these Monuments are critically important habitats for millions of seabirds- focus on density of seabird colonies and forging areas required
- Economic opportunity costs for mining are very high because of fish populations
- Cumulative impacts of unintended consequences such as undersea mining will impact not only the localized area but a large area and the surrounding water column
- Easier to notify mariners of importance of the resources when there are boundaries with a designation
- Economic value of keeping the resources in their current state is greater than extraction
- Keep the seabirds to find the fish
- Deeper areas replenish the nearshore areas used for sustenance fishing
- Scientific and Culturally Important sites
- Not economically feasible to extract the minerals currently

"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."

NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Thorne Abbott
Business Commerce

Glenn Hong
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana
Conservation

Judith Lemus
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney
Fishing

Steve Turner
Hawai'i Island

Maxx Phillips
O'ahu Island

Nina Monasevitch
Kaua'i Island

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Lāna'i Island

Robin Newbold
Maui Island

Vacant
Moloka'i Island

Sabra Kauka
Native Hawaiian

Jim Coon
Ocean Recreation

Mark Deakos
Research

Vacant
Tourism

Tara Leota
Whale Watching

GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Bruce Anderson
Division of Aquatic Resources

Alec Wong
DOH

Sandra Rossetter
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey
OHA (Voting)

Allen Tom
Hawaiian Islands
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma
WESPAC (Voting)

Tunis McElwain
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa
US Navy

- Inappropriate for Fisheries Advisory Councils to manage these areas.
- Recommend that the letters are forwarded to the appropriate parties as a joint letter

GROUP B: BULLETLIST OF TOPICS TO INCLUDE IN COMMENT LETTER FOR THE DRAFT HAWAII-SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA TEST AND TRAINING ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT/OVERSEAS EIS – REPORT OUT

- Decision to write 2 letters on the EIS making the same points
    - Highlight the fact that the RAC and SAC met jointly to discuss
- The Navy EIS is insufficient for the following reasons...
    - More transparency/species specificity on threshold modeling
    - Information presented in the EIS needs to be more species specific
    - Cleanup debris left behind e.g., unexploded ordinance
    - Insufficient details on training activities
    - Include information on all Navy vessels (and other countries) involved in RIMPAC activities
    - No evidence that activities covered under the EIS are inclusive of those of foreign navies
    - Independent observers
    - Show that Navy is consulting with other science/ state of the art acoustic studies e.g., warning sound
    - Look into alternatives to active sonar/ other ways to detect submarines
    - Take limits should be reduced as they are arbitrarily high
- Summary statement: Given our concerns laid out in this letter, we support the no action alternative.
- Lumping of the species and areas between Hawaii and California are a concern. Would prefer two separate EIS for the two separate areas.
- High seas migratory (highly migratory species) species, how are they impacted? Not just marine mammals but also the other species in the area need to be considered. Not sufficient detail on this.
- Affirmative duty to protect under MMPA, a failure to minimize impact to "the least practicable adverse impact". Quote from MMPA-Section 1371(a)(5)(A)(i)(II)(aa).
- Monitoring techniques including aerial surveys are not the best way to analyze the impacts.

The bullestlists are also available on the RAC website.

SAC Action Item: The Council makes a motion to accept the bulletlists as a basis to draft the respective letters. The motion is seconded. The motion passed with twelve votes in favor and one against.

"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."

NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Thorne Abbott
Business Commerce

Glenn Hong
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana
Conservation

Judith Lemus
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney
Fishing

Steve Turner
Hawai'i Island

Maxx Phillips
O'ahu Island

Nina Monasevitch
Kaua'i Island

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Lāna'i Island

Robin Newbold
Maui Island

Vacant
Moloka'i Island

Sabra Kauka
Native Hawaiian

Jim Coon
Ocean Recreation

Mark Deakos
Research

Vacant
Tourism

Tara Leota
Whale Watching

GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Bruce Anderson
Division of Aquatic Resources

Alec Wong
DOH

Sandra Rossetter
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey
OHA (Voting)

Allen Tom
Hawaiian Islands
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma
WESPAC (Voting)

Tunis McElwain
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa
US Navy

Council leadership will draft a comment letter for the Draft Hawaii-Southern California Test and Training Environmental Impact Statement/Overseas EIS. The letter will be submitted before the December 12, 2017 deadline. ONMS Staff will circulate the final letter and it will be available on the RAC website.

The RAC and SAC will co-write a letter to ONMS Director John Armor in response to decision on Presidential Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 based to the approved bulletlist.

The RAC did not have quorum at this point in the meeting. An emergency teleconference meeting will be held to complete the comment letter for the Draft Hawaii-Southern California Test and Training Environmental Impact Statement/Overseas EIS. ONMS Staff will follow-up with Councilmembers to schedule the teleconference.

XIII. PUBLIC COMMENT: Alison Rieser (University of Hawai‘i) wishes to reiterate the public participation within the two organizations. She hopes that the expertise from the Councilmembers holds weight in the administrative record.

XIV. ADJOURNMENT
The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 p.m.

"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."