



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

## 69<sup>th</sup> Meeting

October 1, 2015, 9 am – 5 pm

Pagoda Hotel, International Ballroom, Honolulu

**Purpose:** This is a regular advisory council meeting to include council updates, subcommittee reports and sanctuary highlights.

**Welcome and Introductions:** Sol Kaho'ohalahala (*Acting Chair*) called the meeting to order. Ka'au Abraham opened with a pule. Malia Chow gave welcoming remarks and on behalf of all sanctuary staff thanked Elia Herman for her service to the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary as her state co-manager position ended on September 30. Elia gave parting remarks.

Sol welcomes the newest member to the SAC representing commercial shipping: Glenn Hong from Young Brothers. The council members and meeting attendees briefly introduced themselves.

Acting Secretary Judy Lemus takes attendance.

**Primary SAC council members present:** Malia Chow, Doug Cole, Janice Fukawa, Rick Gaffney, Maka'ala Kaaumoana, Eric Kingma, Teri Leicher, Judy Lemus, Keola Lindsey, Laura McIntyre, Sol Kaho'ohalahala, Walter Ritte, , Sandra Rossetter, Jeff Walters (for Rachel Sprague), George Thompson, Take Tomson (for Jeff Pollack), Suzanne Case, Jim Coon, Rebecca Alakai (for Bob Leinau), Gavin Key (for Kelsey Poole), Mark Deakos (for Jack Kittinger), Clarissa Honeker (for John Taschner), Eric Roberts\*, Matt Sproat\*  
\*not present for role call but arrived at the meeting mid-morning

**Alternate SAC council members present:** Thorne Abbott, Frazer McGilvray

**Excused:** Leo Asuncion, Athline Clarke, Gene Brighthouse, Shelly Lynch, Adam Pack, Jeff Pollack, Veronica Roche, John Taschner, Sabra Kauka, Jack Kittinger, Bob Leinau, Robin Newbold, Kelsey Poole, Rachel Sprague

### Council Business

- 1) Doug Cole made a motion to approve meeting minutes from meeting #68 and Rick Gaffney seconded the motion. All members voted in favor to approve meeting minutes.
- 2) Charter (*Malia Chow*): The Sanctuary Advisory Council charter from 2010 expired in August 2014 and was extended for one year. Another one-year extension through August 2016 has been granted. The charter needs to be updated with input from

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

SAC. In particular, updates may include setting term limits for members and depending on what the final management plan looks like, it will dictate what constituencies are represented on the council. There was agreement to create a working group to update the charter. Sol volunteered to chair the working group. The working group will be open to SAC members and to outside folks. Shannon will take sign-ups for the working group.

- 3) Sub-committees (*Shannon Lyday*): The subcommittees have not been active over the last year due to the management plan review process. There are 4 standing sub-committees: Research, Education, Native Hawaiian, and Conservation. The subcommittees are chaired by the SAC seat. There is a new sign-up sheet that will be passed around today. You can be involved in more than one subcommittee.

### Sub-Committee status:

- Conservation (*Maka'ala Kaaumoana*): There is no work currently underway since the beginning of the management plan review. In the past conservation and research subcommittees met together to work on overlapping issues.
- Education (*Judy Lemus*): Education has also not met since Judy took over as the chair because of all of the council members' involvement in the management plan. The focus of the committee focus is public awareness and understanding of the marine environment. They also work with the other sub-committees on supporting their needs.
- Research (*Mark Deakos*): No update also due to the focus on the management plan.
- Native Hawaiian (*Matt Sproat*). Matt has not arrived at the meeting yet.

- 4) SAC Recruitment (*Shannon Lyday*). The next recruitment for Sanctuary Advisory Council members will be November 2 – 30, 2015 which is tied to the national schedule as posted in the federal register. The recruitment periods have changed and will only be open for one month. There are 17 seats available in the November recruitment. SAC members that have served for two years in their seat will need to re-apply. Shannon showed the seats that will be available during the upcoming recruitment including where people are in their terms.

### The following seats are being recruited for:

- Hawai'i County (primary)
- Hawai'i County (alternate)
- Lāna'i Island (alternate)
- Citizen-at-large (alternate)
- Education (alternate)
- Tourism (alternate)
- Whale Watching (primary)
- Whale Watching (alternate)

#### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawai'i County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinaw  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kaua'i County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lāna'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

#### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

- Fishing (primary)
- Fishing (alternate)
- Research (primary)
- Honolulu County (primary)
- Kaua'i County (primary)
- Kaua'i County (alternate)
- Maui County (primary)
- Maui County (alternate)
- Moloka'i Island (alternate)

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinaw  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kaua'i County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rosseter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

## Status and Update on Management Plan Review (MPR) and Public Comments

Malia Chow presented the MPR timeline. The public comment period is over and staff are currently reviewing public comments. We will reconcile the NOAA proposal with State and public input.

Allen Tom congratulated the SAC on a long and arduous process. He thanked members for their hard work no matter what the result of the management plan review process. HIHW has the largest advisory council in the sanctuary system. Allen Tom described the status of ONMS leadership. Dan Basta is still our director; he is on administrative leave and John Armor is our acting director. The national SAC chairs meeting will be in January 2016. There is a proposal to have a joint regional SAC meeting for the Pacific Region (HIHW, American Samoa, and Papahānaumokuākea).

Allen provided an overview and timeline of where the HIHW Management Plan Review fits in relation to other national actions. There are many other sites across the system that are in the process of management plan reviews, expansions and the addition of other sites to the system. HIHW is the first one in the 2016 calendar to complete their management plan review. Several other sanctuaries are slated for management plan review, which is required every five years. Papahānaumokuākea MNM, Flower Gardens NMS, Monitor NMS, Gray's Reef NMS, Monterey Bay NMS have upcoming management plan reviews. Also there are two new sanctuaries that have been nominated: one in Chesapeake Bay and the other in Lake Michigan.

Concern was expressed that if the management plan review is required every five years yet it takes five years to accomplish. Allen state that at one time ten years was proposed and rejected, and a timeline change would need to be decided by congress.

Maka'ala Kaaumoana stated that it would be useful for the subcommittees to evaluate the progress towards accomplishing a management plan. Malia pointed out that the management plan builds in an evaluation piece to which the SAC plays an important role.

Teri Leicher said that the effort needed for the management plan review consumes a lot of energy and time and reduces the ability to do other things.

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

Malia Chow provided an overview of the binning of the public comments. The sanctuary staff has been working on organizing and evaluating the public comments. NOAA staff and DLNR staff worked together over 3 days to review and analyze the comments. NOAA and DLNR came to agreement on how to bin and route the comments. We are working on developing responses to the public comments. The responses will be incorporated into the revised management plan. Please keep in mind this is not a numbers game advised Malia.

### Summary of Public Comments

- There were 15,066 total submissions received.
- There were 12 public hearings around the state: 772 attendees, 220 oral testimonies, and 99 written comments. This is 2.1 % of the total submissions.
- Petitions and form letters were received from the following from the following: Students of Waimea (52), Friends of Maunalua Bay (1,926) and Marine Conservation Institute (7,335) which accounted for 61% of the total submissions.
- 88 different agencies and organizations submitted comments including government agencies, NGOs, community groups, businesses, and schools.
- Regs.gov could not distinguish where geographically the comments are from (this was an optional and not required field).
- The sanctuary received 3 requests to incorporate communities as focus areas in the sanctuary management plan (Puako, Lanai, Molokai).

Malia gave a summary of the takeaways from staff regarding the comments. There was a lot of vocal opposition on certain islands. On regs.gov there was a lot more support in the comments. Recommendations/comments that the sanctuary received might be relevant to the sub-committees. The sub-committees work feeds into the management plan. Public comments showed that people are interested in how NOAA assets and expertise can support people (communities) on the ground. This may require a revision to the management plan to create action plans for communities that want to become focus areas.

Doug Cole stated that he attended a meeting with community members in Hawaii Kai. He made comments that there are communities and groups in the Hawaii Kai area that are opposed to a special sanctuary management area in Maunalua Bay. People feel like the only option is to stop the process and he doesn't feel that is the case. He would like to better inform the community that there is an opportunity to provide input before the final management plan. He wants to suggest that the SAC form a Maunalua Bay working group to address the need to re-engage these communities. The communities fear the way they enjoy the bay is going to be affected.

Suzanne Case looks forward to the opportunity to engage in Maunalua Bay. There are 3 planning processes occurring for Maunalua Bay 1) Sanctuary proposal 2) Imua Maunalua community planning 3) DOBOR advisory group. Her interest is in unifying these efforts. She recommends the sanctuary focus area development progresses in coordination with the other efforts.

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*

#### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Molokai Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

#### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

Maka'ala recommends that a coordination process that takes into account existing community comments.

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinaw  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rosseter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

Doug: We want to work cohesively with other processes and it's important that the sanctuary be involved in a way so that retrospectively the community cannot say you ignored this. Otherwise, concerned people will feel that the sanctuary cares only about their concerns.

Frazer McGilvray: Imua Manualua started a year ago, which is a marine spatial planning project/marine based planning for Maunalua Bay. Malia has been involved from the beginning. They are currently looking for nominations for the community planning team. It's a blank piece of paper – do not know what the outcome and plan for the bay will be.

Malia: This is the first community to organize themselves to take on a rigorous process. This shows the ability to be replicated in other communities and the sanctuary is invested to see that it does well.

Rick Gaffney: This is not the first time a community planning effort has occurred. West Hawaii Fisheries Management is an example that has of a community based planning effort in order to get rid of conflicts. There are other examples but that is one that sticks out.

Eric Kingma: Asked about the sanctuary focus areas being proposed for Moloka'i and Lana'i. Doesn't this require a change in the draft management plan? Malia responded that these are non-regulatory and that all three are currently within sanctuary boundaries.

Walter Ritte discussed the proposed sanctuary focus area for Moloka'i. Currently the south shore is within the sanctuary boundaries; the north shore is not but trying to figure out how to incorporate. He is concerned about traditional management, which is different than what we are currently doing. The environment is important to sustain you, it is part of survival. We worked hard to create the management plan. When we went into communities it was hard to explain and people just saw the federal government coming in. The state is not doing a good job at managing resources. Other islands are coming to our island to take what little is left. The feds and the state created negative forces from the community perspective and now there is this big plan and the community doesn't understand it's about protecting resources because it was not made clear. It wasn't clear that we are protecting things we are losing such as natural resources that are feeding our families. It is not clear how the state and feds are approaching this issue. They just see government intervention and the government not working together. There was a huge backlash to the plan because there was no support coming from the state and negative support coming from WESPAC. The community is beginning to realize that the federal government might be helpful. He is organizing meetings and figuring out how the sanctuary can help the community and be positive. The community knows what they want but they need partners. Right now working with the state has not been working and hopefully that can change.

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

### Department of Land and Natural Resources Report (*Suzanne Case*)

Suzanne thanked the council for their service. She has been the DLNR chair for 5 months and is learning about sanctuaries and is excited to be a part of it. The state is currently working with NOAA to review the public comments.

Suzanne provided an update on where the state is on the management plan review process. Overall, the state is looking for ways to structure the proposal that complements existing processes, without adding complexities and rules. What is needed is good management and enforcement.

The state will be looking for particular areas of interest from communities. Due to hearing little support for the sanctuary around Ni'ihau, the state may choose not to support that proposed expansion. The state will be examining comments on other issues and paying particular attention to regulatory overlaps.

DLNR's funding from NOAA for the co-manager position lapsed yesterday. So the State has to continue to pursue the funding for the position through a MOA with NOAA. The State will also continue to pursue state funding for the co-manager position. Elia Herman is no longer in the position and Suzanne acknowledged Elia for her past work.

Any official communications will go to the DAR administrator (currently acting DAR administrator is Mr. Alton Miyasaki). DAR will work with the sanctuary to evaluate and respond to comments and develop the compact agreement.

Lastly, because the MOA is out of date this is an opportunity to slow down and hit pause to reflect and have facilitated discussions to help inform how to best work together. We are going to take our time because we want to do it right.

Jim Coon: He is very concerned about Elia not continuing in the co-manager position. The position is vital. The state needs a co-manager position. This would be like flying a 747 and not having a co-pilot. You have someone uniquely qualified for this position and he would feel more comfortable for the State to find the funds for the position. This doesn't serve the sanctuary well. And this is not the only eliminated position. The Kona position is gone as well. These are serious issues in my opinion; especially when the community was assured from the get go that this will be a co-managed sanctuary. It's like smoke and mirrors and it doesn't feel right when there is no funding for the co-manager. He would like to bring the co-manager position to the vote of the SAC for a recommendation/resolution. Also, he is upset about the loss of Dan Basta, and proposes the SAC send a letter to Washington to support Dan and recommend he return to work.

Suzanne: I agree and I am concerned as well. We are sorry; we tried for months to find another solution. The solution is to get that funding back. The voice of the SAC is important.

Jim: So you would be in support of the SAC passing a recommendation/resolution to fund the co-manager position? I am disappointed Dan Basta has fallen out of favor. So much

#### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

#### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

has been done nationally as a result of his vision. I would like to see a vote of confidence from the SAC by sending a letter to Washington through Malia and staff to support Dan Basta and the amazing things he has done in moving the sanctuary plan forward. Finally, we keep finding things out after the fact. We are in a time of fast communication yet we are kept in the dark. We would do a much better job if we had a heads up and ample time to learn new information and do things before the meeting to help solve the issues.

Judy: I agree with Jim's comments. Why can't Elia stay on?

Suzanne: There is a different funding source for Elia to do a different job at the state. Only in her spare time can she work on this (the sanctuary).

Terri: I agree with Judy.

George Thompson: You are pulling Ni'ihau and Kauai from sanctuary plan?

Suzanne: In the public testimony we did not hear strong support.

George: Is there any timeline on when you will make that decision?

Suzanne: Not particularly. I want a review of the public comments first. Once written comments are reviewed we can make a decision.

Maka'ala: Expressed concern about throwing the baby out with the bath water. There was a long standing partnership between Hanalei and DLNR that is a decade old. The community is vibrant and sometimes loud but productive for not only accomplishing community objectives but also fulfilling objectives of DLNR and NOAA. This is not the way I want the state government to respond to those communities who have a positive history and have projects underway. Clearly there is a need for Elia to stay and for her position to be funded. But the funding for DLNR is dire. The only way to get it done is to work together. She is pleading for those communities who lead by example that we not get thrown out with other comments in Kauai that were obviously orchestrated by outside people that she hasn't heard from before. She wants to make it clear this sanctuary will be a valuable partner - with fewer dollars more partners are needed.

Allen: With regards to the state co-manager position, NOAA and DLNR could not come to agreement before the deadline but was able to for PMNM.

Eric K.: Question for Allen: It sounds like the MOU needs to be renewed annually? Can you provide insight on the level of funding for management capacity around the nation? He is worried the financial ability for the sanctuary to expand.

Allen: The Pacific Region is the only region besides the southeastern region (Florida Keys) that has a co-management relationship with the state. The MOA must be renewed every year. But the language should stay the same. Our original MOA with the State of Hawaii was based on Florida. Suzanne agreed to stop in Florida to see how the sanctuary operates

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinaw  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

on her way to the Coral Reef Task Force meeting. We need to have overarching language in agreement with Suzanne on what state co-management looks like so it can be easily funded. In Florida it's based on need. The funding provided to the State of Florida was zero this year. However, funding goes to where the need is – for example funding to colleges. Allen and Suzanne need to flush out what co-management is here in Hawaii. What is the state helping out with? In the State of Michigan, both parties are putting in money.

Judy: Does NOAA fund Florida state co-managers?

Allen: No, they do not.

Walter: I will try to say this is the nicest way possible. The environment is me. I know who my mom and dad and ancestors are and how we relate to the environment to be able to survive in the middle of the Pacific. You must be one and the same with the environment. You have to take care of the resources and pass it on in the same condition or better so future generations can survive. Listening to Suzanne took the wind out of my sails and turned my insides. We are not going to be able to do this with just the State of Hawaii. We are losing all of our resources at an extremely alarming rate. We need partners. It is (expletive) what other people say. The State needs help! People say they are not interested in additional rules. Before it was so strict you would get your head bashed in that's how important it was to preserve resources in the environment. Today you can get away with anything! We depend on barges every day and that is not the solution. You say we don't need better rules we just need better management. That's just fluff. I am nervous about the attitude the State is taking and about them stating we do not need additional rules. Maybe we do need people to come and enforce their rules. It's a joke how the State enforces their rules. I hope the State changes their attitude. It's not about better management. It's about increasing the penalties and the rules and being serious about protecting our natural resources. I talked to DLNR employees and they don't like the feds coming and saying they (state employees) are not going a good job. Well we need to get past that and work together. My stomach is turning after Suzanne spoke and I have to figure out why.

Sol: Suzanne, when this body began several years ago we passed out a resolution recognizing the Kumulipo and its guidance when we talk about ecosystem based management. It allows us to reflect and guide us and the sanctuary in what we do and how we plan. It is clear in the document and chant there are many instances of looking at ecosystem based management, of a place and environment that was interrelated from the air, mountain, sea and people. We had to think about if we should work with a single species or ecosystem and it became evident that the Kumulipo can help guide us in that regard. It became evident that if we look back to the history of this place we can be reminded of the knowledge base that exists.

Sol: We will move to the next order of business and will take on SAC action items later this afternoon.

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT – Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT – Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

### National Marine Fisheries Report (*Jeff Walters*)

Jeff will give a report for the Pacific Islands Regional Office Protected Resources Division for Rachel Sprague, who normally sits on the council.

- Main Hawaii Monk Seal Management Plan
  - NMFS PIRO had an open comment period Aug-Sep on the plan
  - This is not a regulatory document so there was no rule on how long the comment period needed to be
  - This is a strategic plan about managing the monk seal in the Main Hawaiian Islands
  - Plan discusses how to address various issues monk seals face in the Main Hawaiian Islands including the formation of a recovery team (Walter Ritte is on recovery team).
  - Received helpful comments and currently preparing a final plan
  - HIHWNMS is mentioned in the document as a partner
  - The plan is available online
- Proposed Rule to Delist Humpback Whale
  - Petition received well
  - Comment period ended in June
  - Proposal was to create 14 distinct populations in the North Pacific; 10 populations would be delisted including the population that uses Hawaii; Two populations would remain endangered and one would be threatened.
  - ONMS did submit comments on proposed rule.
  - Even if the HI humpback whale is not on the Endangered Species List, it would still be protected by MMPA

#### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaomoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

#### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

Judy: The approach rule is not under the MMPA?

Jeff: It is covered under the ESA rule. There is no fixed distance by law for any other marine mammals in HI except for humpback whales.

Teri: Even if the humpback is delisted no one will be able to hunt them?

Jeff: No, you will not be able hunt them.

Jim: Has the public comment period closed?

Jeff: Yes, the comment period has closed - the plan is all final and went out a couple of months ago for comment.

Malia: The public comment period for delisting has closed, but there may be an opportunity as a council you can talk and make a recommendation to HIHW management that can be forwarded to NMFS on behalf of the council.

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

Jeff: If you want to submit comments on that you may want to consider getting that done quickly as time is of the essence for both, but particularly commenting on the proposed change in status of the humpback whale.

Suzanne: I will defer to Elia to comment from the state's perspective.

Elia: The state also has a 100 yard approach rule in state waters.

Teri: What was approximately the abundance of whales pre-whaling?

Ed: Early numbers we have for the 1900's range from 15,000 – 150,000 pre-whaling.

Sol adjourned the meeting for lunch. Shannon passed out sign-up sheets for the subcommittees.

### Large Whale Response: A Historical Perspective (*Ed Lyman*)

- The sanctuary was the coordinator of the first large whale response program in Hawaii.
- There are several characteristics of Hawaii that are conducive to doing whale response work.
- Our goals are to release some whales, provide experienced response, create public awareness, and identify the source of gear and entanglements.
- Our challenges are opportunistic reporting, limited resources, insulated/isolated environments, and difference in response behavior.
- Our advantages are increased operational safety (calm waters), increased assessment (clear waters), Aloha spirit, and increased scope and efforts.
- Our objectives are risk reduction threat and responding (public safety, network, and fishers).
- We would like to use drones to see the full body of the whale, still working on this one.
- The detail he does in Alaska has helped the sanctuary learn more about the issue and techniques.
- Fisher involvement: info gaining and sharing, disentanglement (independent and network)
- Reports have been collected from 2002-2015
  - Generally reports have increased over time.
  - A lot of young whales are getting entangled.
  - 70% reports come from tour boats.
  - 40% success rate.
  - Collected 9000 fee of line.
  - Pot gear most common.
- Staff spends significant time doing trainings for responders, in Hawaii, nationally and internationally (Mexico, Ecuador, Panama).
  - 420 training hours

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*

#### NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
Business Commerce

James Coon  
Citizen-At-Large

Glenn Hong  
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaomoana  
Conservation

Judith Lemus  
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
Fishing

Adam Pack (Chair)  
Hawaii County

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
Honolulu County

George Thompson  
Kauai County

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
Lana'i Island

Robin Newbold  
Maui County

Walter Ritte  
Moloka'i Island

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
Native Hawaiian

Douglass Cole  
Ocean Recreation

John (Jack) Kittinger  
Research

Kelsey Poole  
Tourism

Vacant  
Whale Watching

#### GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha  
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Suzanne Case  
DLNR

Bruce Anderson  
Division of Aquatic Resources

Laura McIntyre  
DOH

Sandra Rossetter  
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey  
OHA (Voting)

Gene Brighthouse  
NMS of American Samoa

Malia Chow  
Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark  
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack  
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters  
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma  
WESPAC (Voting)

Shelly Lynch  
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts  
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa  
US Navy



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

- 250 personnel trained
- Preparedness: We are storing response gear at spots across the islands
- We do a lot of outreach and education to promote awareness.
- We coordinate a network website gear page, flickr page and network facebook page,
- We participate in workshops and professional meetings presenting research, training and experience.
- We conduct and partner on research including whale disentanglement case studies, biopsy and breath analyses research, and suction cup tagging
- We also help turtles, mantas, dolphins.

Question: Now that Justin is gone who handles the Kona coast?

Jeff: We are still in transition and miss Justin. We have a new partnership with the monk seal hospital but it doesn't include whales. Ed has trained some folks that jumped in and stepped up. HIHW is a shining example for the whole country for marine mammal response. There is value added with the new technology Ed is implementing along with using partnerships creatively.

Allen: Do whales show response to drones?

Ed: So far showing little reaction from large whales. Currently we are just dealing with FAA regulations.

Eric K.: Can you tell the difference between domestic and foreign gear?

Ed: No.

### Sanctuary Advisory Council Motions

Sol asked Jim to present the formal motions for the issues he brought up this morning. Motion 1) Jim Coon motioned and Teri Leicher seconded the following motion: "The Department of Land and Natural Resources should include funds in the state budget for the continuation of the state co-manager position." Passed unanimously (16 voting members present).

Motion 2) Jim Coon motioned and George Thompson seconded the following motion: "NOAA should actively endorse and continue to support and fund the position of state co-manager as provided in the Compact Agreement." Passed unanimously (16 voting members present).

Motion 3) Jim Coon motioned and Teri Leicher seconded the following motion: "The Sanctuary Advisory Council would like to formally recognize the leadership provided by Dan Basta and request his return to Director of National Marine Sanctuaries."

Discussion. Three SAC members abstained voting citing not knowing the reason Dan Basta is on administrative leave or did not know him and his leadership (from new SAC

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*

#### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawai'i County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kaua'i County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

#### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

members). Comment made that we should not deal with personnel issues. Comment that this vote would be to show support of his efforts. Further comment saying we should support someone who has done so much for the sanctuary. After discussion, members voted. Passed with 13 ayes and 3 abstentions.

Maunalua Bay: Sol opened to the council for discussion the Maunalua Bay working group that was suggested by Doug in the morning. There are two options on the table: form a working group or establish a sub-committee. He asked for more information on how this would address issues and work with the community.

Sol led discussion between members, Suzanne, Malia and Allen about how to define and set up a process for how a subcommittee/working group could become engaged in Maunalua.

Malia explained how a working group would need a chair that is a standing member of the SAC.

More discussion about the purpose of the working group, how and why recommendations should be sought, and how the SAC can learn from and share with the interest groups there.

Discussion about who in the SAC could help or support this effort? How can the SAC be active in the various processes that are already underway? We need to prevent existing stakeholders from being lost/confused about all of the processes underway and yet remain involved.

Suzanne to Doug: Can you be the liaison between the sanctuary and the other constituencies and help them engage? He wants to be involved but his schedule may not allow.

Walter: There are three sanctuary focus areas. Why not combine into one team to address these issues? It could be a sanctuary focus area subcommittee.

Malia: Reminds the council that the only proposed regulations for any focus areas are for Maunalua Bay as a Special Sanctuary Management Area.

Doug: Some recommendations need to be made because what's in the proposal now is doomed for failure. If the people don't feel like they helped author the changes then it will fail.

Suzanne prefers not to set up a whole new structure.

Frazer is worried we are trying to overcomplicate the issue. We don't want to exclude but include everyone. He suggests not making a separate group but have SAC members attend the Imua Maunalua community planning meetings, learn details and report back to the council. Doug and Frazer could report to the council on a regular basis. This could be the easiest way to do it.

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
Business Commerce

James Coon  
Citizen-At-Large

Glenn Hong  
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
Conservation

Judith Lemus  
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
Fishing

Adam Pack (Chair)  
Hawaii County

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
Honolulu County

George Thompson  
Kauai County

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
Lana'i Island

Robin Newbold  
Maui County

Walter Ritte  
Molokai Island

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
Native Hawaiian

Douglass Cole  
Ocean Recreation

John (Jack) Kittinger  
Research

Kelsey Poole  
Tourism

Vacant  
Whale Watching

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
DBEDT - Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha  
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Suzanne Case  
DLNR

Bruce Anderson  
Division of Aquatic Resources

Laura McIntyre  
DOH

Sandra Rossetter  
DOT - Harbors

Keola Lindsey  
OHA (Voting)

Gene Brighthouse  
NMS of American Samoa

Malia Chow  
Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark  
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack  
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters  
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma  
WESPAC (Voting)

Shelly Lynch  
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts  
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa  
US Navy



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

Doug likes Frazer's suggestion to report back on what he is observing in the community. He does not feel comfortable representing the entire SAC.

Walter: Since Molokai could be next he would like a heads up so he can come and be involved and learn.

Sol: We need to be proactive instead of reactive. We need to include on future agendas time to hear from community members any updates. He challenges each SAC member to go out and talk to their communities so folks understand what the sanctuary is proposing (for example, to the Puako community because it could be the next Maunalua).

Teri suggested making it a regular agenda item at SAC meetings to keep the council informed. Doug and Frazer could gather information and report back as a way to begin.

Sol repeated the options on the table and asked what is the feeling of council? Council agreed to make it a regular agenda item with reports.

Allen challenged members to go out and make sure we know who in the Maunalua Bay community is involved so that we are not blindsided by someone that was left out of the process.

Doug suggested putting a structure in place to take an active community involvement role.

Sol: For now we can set an agenda item at future meetings and have Doug and Frazer report back to us.

### **XL Catlin Seaview Survey** (*Shannon Lyday and Jon Martinez*)

Jon introduced and provided an overview of the XL Catlin Seaview Survey project.

- Catlin Seaview takes images and conducts research on coral reefs as well as provides community engagement.
- This is a project of the national marine sanctuary system; missions have occurred in Florida Keys, American Samoa, and now Hawaii. Hawaii mission took a year to plan.
- International collaboration with University of Queensland and Underwater Earth.
- The surveys are part of the global reef survey record, which is documenting coral reefs around the world.
- Sites were selected with considerations for management priorities for both ONMS and the State, areas with historical data sets, locations significant for the community, and popular engagement locations.
- There are three components to the project:
  - (1) Science: Underwater scooters with cameras collect data on transects across the coral reefs at 10 meter depth. Camera takes photos which are then identified and evaluated for coral cover via computer "facial recognition"

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*

#### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
Business Commerce

James Coon  
Citizen-At-Large

Glenn Hong  
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
Conservation

Judith Lemus  
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
Fishing

Adam Pack (Chair)  
Hawaii County

Roberts (Bob) Leinaw  
Honolulu County

George Thompson  
Kauai County

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
Lana'i Island

Robin Newbold  
Maui County

Walter Ritte  
Moloka'i Island

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
Native Hawaiian

Douglass Cole  
Ocean Recreation

John (Jack) Kittinger  
Research

Kelsey Poole  
Tourism

Vacant  
Whale Watching

#### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
DBEDT - Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha  
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Suzanne Case  
DLNR

Bruce Anderson  
Division of Aquatic Resources

Laura McIntyre  
DOH

Sandra Rossetter  
DOT - Harbors

Keola Lindsey  
OHA (Voting)

Gene Brighthouse  
NMS of American Samoa

Malia Chow  
Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark  
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack  
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters  
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma  
WESPAC (Voting)

Shelly Lynch  
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts  
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa  
US Navy



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

technology. Auto-detection methods were found to be 95% accurate which was better than human surveyors. Also, auto-detection is more efficient and can be used with GPS location accuracy to collect baseline data for future comparisons, for example damage comparisons after a tropical storm.

- (2) Community Outreach: The second type of system is a tripod with 360 degree swivel camera creating images of local locations that can be shared with the community
  - (3) Educational Outreach: The staff went to community engagement events and schools to explain the mission, technology, and show images of coral reefs in the sanctuary.
- Summary of mission
    - 23 Day Mission
    - 5 Islands
    - 44 Sites
    - 90 km Reef Surveyed
    - 2,700 Photos a Transect
    - 118,800 Photos
    - 5 Schools
    - 3 Community events

Shannon gave details of the mission.

- The mission started on Oahu where ONMS and other NOAA staff were trained on the camera system for both the mission and for the future.
- Each region around ONMS was provided a 360 degree camera to continue working with for one year after the mission is over to continue to collect photos around the sanctuary.
- During the mission the University of Queensland team collected data and sanctuary staff collected images.
- Oahu
  - Engagement photos were captured on the North Shore.
  - Media day was held on Kaneohe Bay.
  - Transects were surveyed on the South Shore.
  - Staff spent a day at Kaiser High School where they presented to over 300 science students.
  - A partnership was developed with Outrigger Hotels.
  - For outreach events 360 degree images were shared using google cardboards.
- Hawaii
  - 11 scientific transects were completed.
  - Engagement photos were taken during 5 dives, including at Puako, Kiholo, and Honaunau.
  - Jack's Dive Locker gave logistical support and also partnered on an evening outreach event. Event was mainly attended by the dive community.
  - Staff spent a day giving presentations at Kealahou High School. Staff were surprised how many students had not been in the water or seen the reefs before and were excited to show them images from Hawaii.

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinaw  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Molokai Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglas Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Keley Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

- Maui Nui
  - Extensive scientific surveys in this region including sites on Maui, Molokai, and Lanai.
  - Evening engagement events were held at the sanctuary visitor center at Kihei and at Whalers Village, and SAC members were invited and participated in both events.
  - The Kihei event was primarily attended by volunteers.
  - The Whalers Village event was attended by the tourism industry. One example of the support was that the Westin general manager said he would like to buy 10,000 google cardboards for guests so they could see the reefs right off shore without needing to go into the water and dive.
  - Staff presented to science classes at Lahainaluna High School.
  - These events were opportunities to show people images of the coral bleaching event now taking place.
  - Engagement events were only held on Maui. We want to work with the council to do more engagement events and reach more schools and communities, especially on Lanai and Molokai.

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
Business Commerce

James Coon  
Citizen-At-Large

Glenn Hong  
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
Conservation

Judith Lemus  
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
Fishing

Adam Pack (Chair)  
Hawaii County

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
Honolulu County

George Thompson  
Kauai County

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
Lana'i Island

Robin Newbold  
Maui County

Walter Ritte  
Moloka'i Island

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
Native Hawaiian

Douglass Cole  
Ocean Recreation

John (Jack) Kittinger  
Research

Kelsey Poole  
Tourism

Vacant  
Whale Watching

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha  
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Suzanne Case  
DLNR

Bruce Anderson  
Division of Aquatic Resources

Laura McIntyre  
DOH

Sandra Rossetter  
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey  
OHA (Voting)

Gene Brighouse  
NMS of American Samoa

Malia Chow  
Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark  
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack  
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters  
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma  
WESPAC (Voting)

Shelly Lynch  
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts  
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa  
US Navy

Maka'ala: This is a good science project. Kauai was not included? Culturally, practitioners and I are concerned. We do not want you looking at things in our ahupua'a. We need to consider who is here doing this and how these images are used. I think it is the sanctuary's kuleana to watch who and why. There are sacred aspects to the water column and the benthic habitat that is nobody else's business. You need to ask. I am very concerned.

Jon: The limited itinerary did not allow us to go to Kauai this time and high coral cover areas were sought and selected. We are sensitive to cultural sites.

Shannon: We need input over the coming year from the SAC to ensure we are being culturally sensitive.

Judy: This is a great education tool, but you should have engaged us ahead of time. It will be good to involve the SAC sub-committees next time. I am wondering about the commercial involvement – who is Catlin?

Malia: XL Catlin is a global insurance company that looks at risk assessment. They have a good understanding of changes happening on land and they don't have a good understanding of what's happening in the ocean. They want to provide global awareness of what's happening in the ocean. They won the innovation of the year award. Images that are taken by Catlin belong to them but we can use them for education; any images taken by our staff can be used as we choose.

Judy: Insurance companies want to know where the risks lie. So are they doing insurance studies prior to climate change effects?

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

Walter asked questions about the transects that were conducted on Molokai. He is interested in getting any baseline data on Molokai reefs – he is wondering how biochemicals used on land will affect the reef.

Jon: We will be happy to work with you on that.

Allen: SAC should have had input even if just an email.

### Public Comment Period

Chair announced it is time for the public comment period. No one asked to submit comments. He opened it back up to the council to continue discussion on XL Catlin Seaview survey.

### XL Catlin Seaview Survey con't

Jon and Shannon discussed tools and more details about photo images and how they can be used.

Walter: Can you use this to identify invasives? For example, can you tell how far gorilla algae have spread?

Jon: Yes, I believe so but software and technology may depend on the size of the subject.

Eric K: I want to point out that the sanctuary has been doing ecosystem-based activities for a long time, such as this mission. Also, for this to be scientific isn't there a need to repeat the study or follow-up over time?

Shannon: The goal of the scientific project is to come back every 5 years. The Catlin team is hoping to come back sooner due to the predicted bleaching event this fall.

Gavin commented about the benefits of technology for science.

Allen: Questions did come up about why our sanctuary was working on this mission.

Malia: We have been asked to put together a next steps/now what list. We are considering what the technology is capable of. For example, Catlin wants to get this into every school, and we need to ask how or why we should be involved.

Allen: We need to increase SAC involvement, and need to have a calendar of upcoming events so that the SAC can play more of a role in projects like this.

Doug: This is a good way to provide data and show how sites are doing, for example, in Maunaloa Bay. You could gain some baseline data and research to support the plan.

Maka'ala: We need to manage unintentional consequences by talking with the people of a place. When you chose places to go, you mentioned places with "high percentage of coral cover?" How do you define that?

#### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
Business Commerce

James Coon  
Citizen-At-Large

Glenn Hong  
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
Conservation

Judith Lemus  
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
Fishing

Adam Pack (Chair)  
Hawaii County

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
Honolulu County

George Thompson  
Kauai County

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
Lana'i Island

Robin Newbold  
Maui County

Walter Ritte  
Moloka'i Island

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
Native Hawaiian

Douglass Cole  
Ocean Recreation

John (Jack) Kittinger  
Research

Kelsey Poole  
Tourism

Vacant  
Whale Watching

#### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
DBEDT – Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha  
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Suzanne Case  
DLNR

Bruce Anderson  
Division of Aquatic Resources

Laura McIntyre  
DOH

Sandra Rossetter  
DOT – Harbors

Keola Lindsey  
OHA (Voting)

Gene Brighouse  
NMS of American Samoa

Malia Chow  
Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark  
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack  
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters  
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma  
WESPAC (Voting)

Shelly Lynch  
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts  
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa  
US Navy

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

Shannon: We didn't just choose sites by coral cover; we also chose special areas and areas of interest to management.

Jon: The transects were chosen in areas that appeared to have a certain amount of coral cover to meet the 1 km coral transect goal of the University of Queensland. We also considered the site of the reef, the number of reefs near each other, and travel distance to maximize efficiency and dollars spent.

Sol: There were cultural concerns with Google Street View for using this technology across Papahānaumokuākea. Who owns the images after taking photos? We found that Google did, and the cultural community was concerned about the library not being used appropriately. I did not know you went to Lanai with this project, this is the first I heard of it. We need to get to the nitty gritty of who is the authority when gathering the images. Are we only looking at pristine coral reefs or are we considering damage, bleaching? My point is don't just show children pristine reefs but show the not so good side too, so children get the importance of being involved.

Walter: Reefs should be considered a national treasure. Hawaii can double the capacity of reefs with fishponds. Could these cameras and software be used to manage a fishpond?

Sol thanked Jon and Shannon for their presentation.

### Subcommittee Topics/Membership:

Malia went over staff assignments to help the standing subcommittees:

Research: Jon Martinez

Culture: Ka'au Abraham

Education: Ka'au Abraham with support from Patty Miller

Conservation: Anne Walton - Need a replacement

Shannon Lyday will be the staff assigned to the charter working group.

Maka'ala: My suggestion is that bigger issues, for example underwater cables, should be addressed by more than one subcommittee and are the opportunities for collaboration – that is why I signed up for Education. Conservation may be the most blurred but that could be a good thing.

Matt Sproat: Sanctuaries are world-wide but here in Hawaii it is unique. This last presentation is an example of how our subcommittee could give advice about what is appropriate, how it could be best accomplished, or if it needs more consideration.

Mark: I spoke briefly with Jack, and most of the past work was focused on management plan review, and I will defer to Jack to provide more guidance when he returns. I have one comment, we need to identify the main threats. For example, sedimentation. What ways can we focus our research and energy?

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*

#### NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
Business Commerce

James Coon  
Citizen-At-Large

Glenn Hong  
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
Conservation

Judith Lemus  
Education

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
Fishing

Adam Pack (Chair)  
Hawaii County

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
Honolulu County

George Thompson  
Kauai County

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
Lana'i Island

Robin Newbold  
Maui County

Walter Ritte  
Moloka'i Island

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
Native Hawaiian

Douglass Cole  
Ocean Recreation

John (Jack) Kittinger  
Research

Kelsey Poole  
Tourism

Vacant  
Whale Watching

#### GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
DBEDT - Office of Planning

Veronica Rocha  
DBEDT Renewable Energy

Suzanne Case  
DLNR

Bruce Anderson  
Division of Aquatic Resources

Laura McIntyre  
DOH

Sandra Rossetter  
DOT - Harbors

Keola Lindsey  
OHA (Voting)

Gene Brighouse  
NMS of American Samoa

Malia Chow  
Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS

Athline Clark  
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Jeffrey Pollack  
NOAA OLE

Jeff Walters  
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Eric Kingma  
WESPAC (Voting)

Shelly Lynch  
US Army Corps of Engineers

Eric Roberts  
US Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa  
US Navy



## Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

Sol: Today we are establishing a charter working group. The current charter is in your packet. You may want to look at it and help decide how to move this document forward.

Maka'ala: I have been in working groups but not sure what the process is for working with a subcommittee.

Malia: The current constraint in the charter with regards to sub-committees is that we cannot pay for travel.

Judy: The education subcommittee will meet briefly after the meeting if anyone is interested.

Sol: Any additional members have comments? Thank you for attending.

4:06 pm: Meeting adjourned.

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Teri Leicher  
*Business Commerce*

James Coon  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Glenn Hong  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Judith Lemus  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawaii County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinaw  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lana'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kelsey Poole  
*Tourism*

Vacant  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT - Office of Planning*

Veronica Rocha  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

Suzanne Case  
*DLNR*

Bruce Anderson  
*Division of Aquatic Resources*

Laura McIntyre  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT - Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jeffrey Pollack  
*NOAA OLE*

Jeff Walters  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Shelly Lynch  
*US Army Corps of Engineers*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*