



DRAFT – Subject to Council approval or revisions at Council Meeting #67  
Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine  
Sanctuary Advisory Council

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

**NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Tetsuzan Benny Ron  
*Business Commerce*

Cindi Punihaole Kennedy  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Richard Davison  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Vacant  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawai'i County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kaua'i County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lina'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kimokeo Kapahulehua  
*Tourism*

Jim Coon  
*Whale Watching*

**GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT – Office of Planning*

Andrea Gill  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

William J. Aila Jr.  
*DLNR*

Elia Herman  
*DLNR – Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Gary Gill  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT – Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

David Swatland  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Take Tomson  
*NOAA OLE*

Rachel Sprague  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Athline M. Clark  
*US ACOE*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

66<sup>th</sup> Meeting

August 7th, 2014 || 9:30 am to 11:30 am  
via online meeting software and conference line

**Purpose:** The purpose of this meeting is to discuss the Call To Action Joint Statement by the Marine Protected Areas Federal Advisory Committee and the National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Councils “Destination Marine Protected Areas: Sustaining America’s Most Treasured Ocean Places for Recreation and Stewardship” as a potential council action item.

Chair Adam Pack welcomes all participants to the Sanctuary Advisory Council. He explains the principal purpose of the meeting is to discuss the Call To Action Joint Statement by the Marine Protected Areas Federal Advisory Committee and the National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Councils “Destination Marine Protected Areas: Sustaining America’s Most Treasured Ocean Places for Recreation and Stewardship” as a potential council action item, and thanks the superintendent and staff for coordinating and hosting this meeting.

Vice-Chair Solomon Kaho’ohalahala opens the meeting with a pule.

Vice-Chair Solomon Kaho’ohalahala fills in for the excused Secretary and takes attendance.

**Primary council members present:** Maka’ala Kaaumoana, Matt Sproat, Adam Pack, Bob Leinau, George Thompson, Solomon Kaho’ohalahala, Robin Newbold, Keola Lindsey, Andrea Gill, Leo Asuncion, Elia Herman, Malia Chow, Rachel Sprague, Eric Roberts, Janice Fukawa, Eric Kingma

**Alternate council members present:** Donna Brown, Thorne Abbott, Gordon La Bedz, Greg Kaufman, Nina Monasevitch, Judy Lemus

**Others present:** Linda Paul, Dean Hudson, Joseph Paulin, Ka’au Abraham, Fiona Langenberger, Jordan Ching, Jean Souza

**Excused:** Jack Kittinger, Kimokeo Kapahulehua, Jim Coon, Doug Cole, Rick Gaffney, Sandra Rossetter, Gene Brighthouse, David Swatland, Take Tomson

**Introductions:** Council members and meeting attendees briefly introduce themselves

**Meeting overview:** Chair Adam Pack reviews the agenda for this SAC meeting

**Approval of meeting minutes:** Maka’ala Kaaumoana motions to approve minutes of council meeting #65. Motion seconded by Robin Newbold. Motion passed unanimously

**Presentation of the Call to Action Joint Statement, presented by Joseph Paulin**

Joseph Paulin, Conservation Ecology and Policy Specialist of the National Marine Sanctuary of American Samoa, begins his presentation by providing some background information on the Call to Action Joint Statement, and explains that the final document was a product of a joint collaboration between the Marine Protected Areas Federal Advisory Council (MPA FAC) and the National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Councils (NMSAC). The joint statement addresses the increased emphasis of eco-tourism to Federal lands and waters, and how this could affect public interaction with national marine sanctuaries and marine protected

*“The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai’i.”*



## DRAFT – Subject to Council approval or revisions at Council Meeting #67 Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Tetsuzan Benny Ron  
*Business Commerce*

Cindi Punihaole Kennedy  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Richard Davison  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Vacant  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawai'i County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kaua'i County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lina'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaioa Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kimokeo Kapahulehua  
*Tourism*

Jim Coon  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT – Office of Planning*

Andrea Gill  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

William J. Aila Jr.  
*DLNR*

Ella Herman  
*DLNR – Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Gary Gill  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT – Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

David Swatland  
*Papahānaumokuākea NMN*

Take Tomson  
*NOAA OLE*

Rachel Sprague  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Athline M. Clark  
*US ACOE*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

areas throughout the country. The idea of the joint statement was initially conceptualized at the 2012 SAC summit, where various members of both the National Marine Sanctuary of American Samoa Advisory Council and the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council were represented. This idea was further built on at the 2014 SAC Summit, with joint sessions and breakout groups with members of the MPA FAC and NMSAC, aimed to further develop the draft statement, discuss additional concepts that should be included, and also to identify the specific target audiences and steps to disseminate the final document. After much deliberation, the final draft joint statement was approved, with the purpose of the document being to ensure proactive management of growing ocean recreation in Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) that is culturally responsible.

The Call to Action is meant to chart a new course for MPAs to ensure protection in an appropriate way that is sustainable for the future. More specifically, there were 4 specific calls to federal actions which included: 1) To invite people to play responsibly in MPAs, 2) Embrace the human dimensions of ocean places, 3) Sustain MPA ecosystems and values, and 4) Engage recreations users as ocean stewards to ensure their understanding of the importance of culture and place. To achieve this goal, collaboration between agencies, additional funding, and building partner capacity will be as important as ever. Joseph Paulin closes by discussing the potential council action that could happen today, which will include to discuss the final joint statement, and to decide if the council would like to support the statement as is. He also notes that it is not possible to make additional edits to the document.

Adam asks Dean Hudson (Chair of the National Marine Sanctuary of American Samoa Advisory Council) and Linda Paul (Vice Chair of the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve Advisory Council) if they have any additional comments. Dean adds that this all started as an idea in 2012, and with the collaboration of all who were involved he believes that the document put forth best reflects the intended purpose of the joint statement. Linda mentions that initially, the draft that was presented in 2012 was too focused on recreation, and not on stewardship, however this was addressed at the 2014 SAC summit, with stewardship being an emphasis as to make users aware of their potentially negative impacts to MPAs.

Adam seconds all of the important items that Dean and Linda addressed, and adds that this document was partly a response to the new executive order to expand travel to federal lands and waters. Adam also reiterates Joseph's point that this document was meant to be a proactive statement to emphasize the protections of our MPAs and marine resources.

### **Discussion of Call to Action Joint Statement (Action Item)**

Maka'ala Kaaumoana states that although she understands the purpose of this document, and how much effort went into it, she needs to say that this was a "hard pill to swallow" because of the emphasis of the tourism component. Maka'ala understands that this was done as a response to expanded tourism, but believes that there are certain areas that need to be excluded from this emphasis of expanded travel. She notes that Kaua'i is already overrun by tourism, and that it is difficult to make ocean stewards out of tourists who are here for only two days.

Gordon LaBedz states that he believes the main threats to the MPAs are fisherman, the navy, and ocean recreation. He also asserts that he will vote against this item. Bob Leinau responds to Gordon and Maka'ala by stating that this particular document itself is not encouraging more tourism, but more so is addressing the need to manage the increasing amount of tourism that is taking place in MPAs. Bob states that tourists are not going away, the goal is to disseminate more information to ensure the safety of our MPAs and resources, and that the scope of this document is within our own mission statement.

Ke'ola Lindsay asks if the U.S. Federal Government has an official definition for recreation and activity. Malia Chow answers by stating any activity that is not commercial.

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*



## DRAFT – Subject to Council approval or revisions at Council Meeting #67 Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

### **NON-GOVERNMENT** (Voting)

Tetsuzan Benny Ron  
*Business Commerce*

Cindi Punihaole Kennedy  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Richard Davison  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Vacant  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawai'i County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kauai County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lina'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Ritte  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaiola Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kimokeo Kapahulehua  
*Tourism*

Jim Coon  
*Whale Watching*

### **GOVERNMENT** (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT – Office of Planning*

Andrea Gill  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

William J. Aila Jr.  
*DLNR*

Ella Herman  
*DLNR – Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Gary Gill  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT – Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

David Swatland  
*Papahānaumokuākea NMN*

Take Tomson  
*NOAA OLE*

Rachel Sprague  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Athline M. Clark  
*US ACOE*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

Joseph emphasizes that the meaning of this document differs from “place to place”. He adds that the purpose of this statement is to place responsibility to agencies and groups who help to manage these areas, and it won’t be the same thing for each protected area. Joseph emphasized that this was not only a call to action but a call to be responsible for these places in the future. Linda adds that the document does acknowledge the need to make inaccessible/protected areas recognized to prevent overuse/any use. Ke’ola follows up by asking why the National Marine Monument is not included as an example for MPAs, and Joseph answers that the list of examples were not meant to be all inclusive, and that there is an understanding that there are other MPAs not listed that can be considered.

Robin Newbold expresses her concern about Joseph’s opening statement saying that there is a movement to increase tourism/commercial activity, when the islands are already overrun by so many tourist/commercial activity. Solomon joins in by stating that we are trying to make decisions on our participation or involvement with this document, and at the same time are in the middle of defining our scope as a sanctuary. He mentions that Lana’i is completely surrounded by sanctuary waters, and is concerned that by supporting this document we would be promoting the access to Lana’i specifically because of its inclusion in sanctuary boundaries. Solomon expresses his desire for a “balance” in this document to ensure that communities like Lana’i are not so greatly affected by this. Solomon states that he could support this as long as this “balance” can be achieved. Adam reiterates that many of these issues that are being brought up have been addressed during the summit, and that he believes that the document does achieve this “balance” that Solomon is referring to.

Eric Kingma states that he shares the concerns of Robin and Solomon, and goes on to say that the statement is so general that it does not really apply to Hawai’i’s local needs, and if we can’t change it, it would be difficult to get on board with this. He expresses that he would like to see an opportunity for each unique system to sign on to something more specific to its own place and needs. Malia states that she believes this statement does give each site the leeway and freedom to apply this action in a “place by place” basis to ensure proper management. Robin asks Malia what benefit does she believe this document will have to the sanctuary? Malia answers that the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary has been selected to serve as a potential model for this policy, which gives the sanctuary an entrée to have more discussions about the management of our resources in a responsible matter. Donna Brown states that this document seems to have been well-constructed, and properly addresses the concerns that were brought up by the advisory council. Donna states that the document spells out what we need to do to keep things healthy, strong, and in control of the local people.

Dean reiterates that the purpose of this document was to get our point across to the White House that MPAs are important, and that responsible management of them are imperative, especially with new initiatives to increase eco-tourism in federal waters. Dean goes on to say that the statement was not meant to address specific needs of individual MPAs, but more so to put forward a general statement to make our voice heard.

To clarify the concerns expressed by the council, Adam reads through the Joint Statement. After hearing the document in its entirety, Maka’ala states that she completely and totally respects the process, purpose, and intent of this document, and understands that the council is unable to make edits. With that being said Maka’ala wonders if there will be an opportunity for the council to contribute a supporting document or statement that can express the concerns brought up today, including the added pressure that increasing tourism/recreational can impose on Hawai’i. Solomon and Eric Kingma support the idea of creating a letter to Dan Basta to address the council’s concerns. Gordon LaBedz states that there are certainly aspects of this document that we can agree on, but he wants to be clear that he is absolutely against any initiative to increase tourism.

*“The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai’i.”*



## DRAFT – Subject to Council approval or revisions at Council Meeting #67 Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

### NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Tetsuzan Benny Ron  
*Business Commerce*

Cindi Punihaole Kennedy  
*Citizen-At-Large*

Richard Davison  
*Commercial Shipping*

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana  
*Conservation*

Vacant  
*Education*

Myrick (Rick) Gaffney  
*Fishing*

Adam Pack (Chair)  
*Hawai'i County*

Roberts (Bob) Leinau  
*Honolulu County*

George Thompson  
*Kaua'i County*

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala  
*Lina'i Island*

Robin Newbold  
*Maui County*

Walter Rittie  
*Moloka'i Island*

Matthew Kawaioia Sproat  
*Native Hawaiian*

Douglass Cole  
*Ocean Recreation*

John (Jack) Kittinger  
*Research*

Kimokeo Kapahulehua  
*Tourism*

Jim Coon  
*Whale Watching*

### GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Leo Asuncion  
*DBEDT – Office of Planning*

Andrea Gill  
*DBEDT Renewable Energy*

William J. Aila Jr.  
*DLNR*

Ella Herman  
*DLNR – Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

Gary Gill  
*DOH*

Sandra Rossetter  
*DOT – Harbors*

Keola Lindsey  
*OHA (Voting)*

Gene Brighthouse  
*NMS of American Samoa*

Malia Chow  
*Hawaiian Islands  
Humpback Whale NMS*

David Swatland  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Take Tomson  
*NOAA OLE*

Rachel Sprague  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

Eric Kingma  
*WESPAC (Voting)*

Athline M. Clark  
*US ACOE*

Eric Roberts  
*US Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*US Navy*

### Management Plan Review Status Update

Malia gives a status update on the Management Plan Review Process. Malia states that at this point the proposal has been cleared by the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries, and should receive formal approval by the end of next week. Malia believes that we are on schedule to release the approved document to the public in a September/October timeline, and adds that at this time it is a NOAA only proposal, and the state has allowed the public to weigh in. Malia reiterates that the sanctuary is on track, and ready for the upcoming year.

### Public Comments – No public comments

### Action Item

Bob Leinau moves to endorse the Call to Action document as presented during today's meeting and Ke'ola Lindsay seconds the motion. Solomon conducts the vote, and announces that the motion passes (10 Ayes, 1 Nay, 1 Abstain). Adam explains that he will sign the Joint Statement on behalf of the sanctuary. However, to follow up on Maka'ala's request to draft a letter that accompanies the Call to Action document, the executive committee will discuss this letter in more detail during the next executive committee conference call and draft a letter and share it with the full council.

### New Business

Fiona Langenberger reports that the sanctuary is currently in the process of getting 10 members seated and that the applications are currently being processed by headquarters. During the recruitment cycle of May/June 2014, 6 seats were advertised (2 primary, 4 alternate). Fiona is currently seeking volunteers to be on the selection committee, and she asks council members to email her if they are interested. The next recruitment cycle will be in November/December 2014, with a number of alternate seats to be advertised. Adam asks Fiona to clarify the scheduling of term limits for each seat, and Fiona states that she will send out an email to clarify.

Adam asks Malia and Elia if they have any additional items. Malia wants to let everyone know that there will be a two-day Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting once the draft proposal is released to the public. The meeting will likely be on Oahu. The council will not be asked to take action on the proposal at this meeting, but rather at the next gathering towards the end of the public comment period.

Adam thanks everyone for participating in this meeting, especially considering the weather, and also thanks Solomon for acting as secretary and for providing the opening pule. Bob Leinau moves to end the meeting and Maka'ala seconds the motion.

11:18 am

Pau

*"The opinions and findings of this letter/publication do not necessarily reflect the position of the sanctuary, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration or the State of Hawai'i."*